

Listening to Teachers' Feedback on how INSIGHTS into Children's Temperament Transforms Classroom Management Approaches

Sharline Cole, Loraine D. Cook

The University of the West Indies, Mona

Abstract

INSIGHTS is an evidence-based, comprehensive intervention that enhances the social-emotional development and academic learning of young children (aged 3–8 years) and their parents' and teachers' behaviour management skills. Children also learn problem-solving strategies to resolve dilemmas with parents, teachers, and peers. Qualitative interviews were conducted to explore teachers' views on how INSIGHTS into Children's Temperament transformed their classroom management approaches. The programme is underpinned by theoretical frameworks for temperament-based intervention: Goodness of Fit Model (2), which purports that the environment should be adjusted to align with the temperament of a child; and social

learning theory. Both frameworks offer theoretical explanations on how the environment interacts with children's temperament.

Data were collected using two focus groups: one group consisted of six classroom teachers and the other group had five participants, including the principal. The thematic analysis of the qualitative data revealed that teachers were more conscious of their students' temperament profile and the implications for embracing the goodness of fit as they reframed their perceptions about the children. Understanding and working with children based on their temperament was considered significant in classroom behaviour management. The INSIGHTS programme is transformative because it enhances relationships and the skills learned are sustainable and transferable.

Keywords: INSIGHTS, children's temperament, classroom management approaches

Introduction

INSIGHTS into Children's Temperament (INSIGHTS) is a comprehensive intervention that includes teachers, parents, and classroom programmes. The intervention was developed in partnership with educators and parents in under-resourced urban public schools in New York City. Sandee McClowry developed the programme and was the principal investigator of the three clinical trials that tested its efficacy.

With temperament (personality) theory as its foundation, *INSIGHTS* provides parents and teachers with a framework for appreciating the individual differences of children. Temperament is the consistent behavioural style that a child demonstrates across a variety of settings and circumstances. The INSIGHTS programme helps parents and teachers to replace negative patterns of interaction and harsh disciplinary

practices with responsive ones that match a child's temperament. The programme enhances children's self-regulation by strengthening their empathy and problem-solving skills.

The content of the teacher and parent programme is delivered by a facilitator using a structured curriculum that includes didactic content, professionally produced vignettes, handouts, group activities, and individual assignments. In the classroom programme, the facilitator and

the children's teachers use puppets to train the children to develop the skills needed to resolve daily dilemmas. The puppets exemplify different temperaments of school-age children, as illustrated in Figure 1: Coretta the Cautious (cautious/slow to warm), Gregory the Grumpy (high maintenance), Fredrico the Friendly (social/eager to try), and Hilary the Hard Worker (industrious).

Figure 1

Puppets representing the temperaments of school-age children



INSIGHTS into Children's Temperament is an evidence-based intervention with teacher, parent, and classroom programmes that work synchronously to support children's social-emotional development and academic learning. INSIGHTS' efficacy has been tested in three clinical trials funded by the United States' Institute of Education Sciences and the National Institutes of Health. Cappella et al. (2015) found that INSIGHTS, compared to a control condition, enhanced student engagement and teachers' practices in the classroom. In Jamaica, preliminary assessments of the programme have been carried out within varied contexts. In 2012, a 3-day workshop was conducted with Jamaican teacher-trainers, development officers, and persons in supervisory positions from the Early Childhood Commission (ECC). These participants were very positive toward the principles of the INSIGHTS intervention and they felt the content of the programme was relevant to the

Jamaican context. Subsequently, presentations giving an overview of the programme were made to educators at the Ministry of Education. The INSIGHTS intervention received full support from Ministry of Education executives—the Permanent Secretary, Mrs. Elaine Foster Allen; and the Chief Education Officer, Mrs. Grace Mclean. In Semester 2 of the academic year 2013–2014, with the permission of the Ministry of Education and in collaboration with the Early Childhood Commission, the programme was implemented in three schools: Alpha Infant and Primary, Central Branch All Age, and John Mills All Age schools.

Theoretical Framework

Social Learning Theory

The Social Learning Theory (SLT) has been identified as one of the most influential theories in learning and development that explains the

development and modification of behaviours (Nabavi, 2012). According to (David, 2016 p. 44), "Social learning theories emphasize on changes in behaviour and learning through the observation and imitation of the actions and behaviours in the environment". The theory postulates that children learn appropriate/inappropriate social skills through observational and vicarious learning (Slavin, 2012). Bandura (1965, 1977) posits that reinforcement administered after observation of a particular behaviour tends to contribute to reinforced behaviour being used again. For Bandura, cognition plays a significant role in learning, which is a shift from traditional behaviourism. This suggests that observing behaviour and the consequences that follow the behaviour do not necessarily contribute to the reproduction or reduction of the behaviour. For learning to take place, the social learning theory is guided by four elements; attention, retention, reproduction, and motivation (Bandura, 1965). The theory proposes that children learn from observing others, then modeling the behaviour based on the attention paid to the behaviour being modeled. The attention focused on the model producing the behaviour, the level of internalization of the behaviour, and the consequences observed will likely lead to the retention of the behaviour. The child is likely to reproduce the behaviour that has been learned when placed again in a similar situation. One is motivated to reproduce the behaviour based on how one internalizes the consequences; positive consequences are likely to see a child more motivated to reproduce the behaviour, while negative consequences are likely to reduce the motivation to reproduce the behaviour (Bandura, 1965; Bandura & Walters, 1977; Horsburgh & Ippolito, 2018). Attention is more likely to be focused on behaviours that are novel. In addition, certain characteristics of the person modeling the behaviour will attract the attention of the observer, for example when the person modeling the behaviour is attractive and is perceived positively. For retention to take place, the observer rehearses the behaviour and tries to replicate it.

Additionally, one must be motivated to replicate the behaviour learned, but the behaviour may vary depending on the level of development and the consequences previously observed as a result of that same behaviour (Nabavi, 2012).

One key feature of the social learning theory is reciprocal determinism, which "emphasizes that behavior, personal factors, and environmental factors are all equal, interlocking determinants of each other" (Kelland, 2021, para. 14, lines 9-10). This explains that the combination of dispositions or traits, interaction with the environment, and the consequences of action all contribute to the behaviour exhibited. Socialization and social interaction play critical roles as children navigate their environments, learn to conform to societal norms, and learn behavioural restraint or self-regulation (Kelland, 2021). As a result of this interaction, children's self-efficacy develops, determining how they perform and behave in school. Children who have a low sense of self-efficacy (particularly social efficacy), may experience challenges in the classroom which could lead to aggression (Kelland, 2021).

Although the Social Learning Theory provides an understanding of human behaviour and how motivation can influence learning, it does not take into consideration the intrinsic motives for wanting to learn. Furthermore, aspects of maturation and changes over the lifespan are not regarded (Nabavi, 2012).

Goodness of Fit

"Understanding temperament is a useful tool for early childhood teachers to promote goodness-of-fit which occurs when teaching or caregiving practices positively align with children's temperament and classroom interactions" (McCormick et al., 2018 in Sealy et al., 2021, p. 8). Kinkead-Clark (2020) and White et al. (2018) posit similar views that understanding the temperament of children at the early childhood level helps caregivers and teachers to embrace differences in children. According to Hipson and Séguin (2017) goodness of fit explains that an optimal outcome is possible when there is a matching of children's

temperament with environmental demands. For Ostergren (2004), Goodness of Fit is the matching of the demands and expectations of parents with the temperament of the child. Similarly, the Center for Early Childhood Mental Health Consultation, Innovation and Improvement Project's Infant Toddler Temperament Tool (IT³) (n. d.) reports that a Goodness of Fit happens when the expectations of the adults and their approaches to parenting/caregiving accommodate their children's personality traits and is supportive of their children's wellbeing.

Whenever there is mismatch or poor fit between children's temperament and the motivational support for learning offered by teachers' relationships and students' outcomes are negatively impacted (Roubinov et al., 2017). Thomas and Chess in Hipson and Séguin (2015) "characterized children whose temperament was consistent with the environment as exemplifying a good fit, whereas those whose temperament was dissonant with the environment had a poor fit" (p. 2). In addition, teacher student relationships are moderated by the temperament of the children (Hipson & Séguin, 2015). In their study with preschoolers, Hipson and Séguin (2015) sought to establish whether or not Goodness of Fit between children's temperament and the teacher-child relationship is likely to predict aggressive and prosocial behaviours. The results suggest that a child's prosocial behaviour is associated with the relationship between the child and teacher. Additionally, "temperament was found to significantly moderate the association between teacher-child relationship and prosocial behaviour" (Hipson & Séguin, 2015, p. 9), with optimal temperament (i.e., being resilient), having a stronger association with teacher-child relationship and prosocial behaviour (Hipson & Séguin, 2015). In their study, Roubinov et al. (2017) conclude that teacher-child relationship and classroom climate influence students' temperament and physiological stress regulation as they transition into kindergarten. Consequently, the quality of the environment and the interactions influence the temperamental traits of students.

Literature Review

Understanding Children's Temperament

Rothbart and Gars Tein (2008) in Kornienko (2016) define temperament as inherited traits that explain the differences in how individuals regulate their emotions, attention, and actions; expressed in behaviours related to their environmental situations. In addition, Duckworth and Allred (2012), state that temperament refers to

"individual differences in behaving, feeling, and thinking that are relatively stable across time and situation and reflect the relatively enduring biological makeup of the organism, influenced over time by heredity, maturation, and experience" (p. 627).

There are three types of temperament: easy, difficult, and slow to warm up (Thomas & Chess, 1971 in Sealy et al., 2021). A child considered to be of an easy temperament is adaptable, tends not to get easily upset, and is of a happy disposition. The difficult (active or feisty) child tends to get easily upset, has intense reactions, is likely to be fearful of new people and situations, and is considered a fussy child. The child who is slow to warm up is likely to be less active and fussy and may withdraw from new situations. However, with repeated exposure, a child that is slow to warm up can develop positive reactions to meeting new people and being introduced to new situations (Center on the Social and Emotional Foundations for Early Learning, 2010).

The temperament of students impacts their educational outcomes. Sealy et al. (2021) identified different temperament profiles of school age children that influence classroom engagement: negative reactivity, task persistence, withdrawal, and activity—where children possess a mix of the different temperaments. Children can fall on a continuum from low to medium to high in the four dimensions of temperament profile (McClowry, 2014). Negative reactivity is the extent to which a child may have a negative

response to a situation, which may be communicated by body language (e.g., a facial expression denoting discontent). Task persistence indicates how likely it is that a child will stick to a task until it is done; withdrawal measures how a child responds to new people and situations; and activity refers to how frequently a child moves about (McClowry, 2014).

Children's temperament is based on culture, with some variations within each culture (Sealy et al., 2021). Sealy et al. (2021) found that children raised in one collectivist culture, i.e. the cultural values and norms of the community or group have precedence over individuals' values, were likely to have higher negative affectivity, while in another collectivist culture children were likely to exercise greater self-control. Children raised in both individualistic and collectivistic cultures tend to be more impulsive and engage in higher motor activity. Sealy et al. (2021) concluded that schools which engage in culturally relevant classrooms are able to accommodate the different temperaments of children. Kornienko's (2016) study evaluated the impact of children's temperament on the mother/child relationship, finding that the different temperament characteristics of children were more likely to predict the relationship mothers have with them. The findings suggest that attention span and persistence predict positive relationships and confidence that their children will behave appropriately, while adaptability predicts mildness in temperament. Mothers are likely to spend more time controlling their children when the children's threshold of responsiveness is high in distractibility. They concluded that "children's temperament is a dimension of mother's relation to child" (Kornienko, 2016, p. 346).

In a study by Middleton (2012) that examined the association among children's temperament, similarity between parent and child temperament, parenting behaviours, stress, and the behavioural problems of children ages 3-5, it was found that mothers' parenting stress was associated with their children's externalizing behavioural problems. The data suggest that children with high activity levels were less flexible in their

behavioural styles and their mood was affected by parenting stress. In addition, mothers were likely to use negative/inconsistent punitive parenting when they experienced high levels of parenting stress. For children with easy temperament, mothers also had easy temperament and lower levels of parenting stress (Middleton, 2012).

The temperament of children is affected by environmental factors and teachers' commitment and how they respond to children (Isa et al., 2017). Roubinov et al. (2017) concluded that teacher-child relationship and classroom climate influence students' temperament and their physiological stress regulation as they transition into kindergarten. Consequently, the quality of the environment and the interactions influence the temperamental traits of students. According to Isa et al. (2017) children's temperament impacts their development of self-concept and how they adjust to positive behaviours in the classroom. Kinkead-Clark (2020) found that teachers, as a result of their limited understanding of the temperament of their students, tended to use harsh disciplinary methods. Isa et al. (2017) therefore suggested that, in ensuring appropriate accommodation of students with different temperaments, teachers should have the relevant knowledge and skills.

The accommodation of students' temperament will "create opportunities and space towards the well-being and success of children through commitment, support and positive response" (Isa et al., 2017, p. 180). Likewise, Roubinov et al. (2017) state that children with high negative affectivity and high effortful control are likely to experience increased stress when the classroom has little encouragement for students. Earlier research by Nelson et al. (1999) discovered that negative emotionality significantly predicted school performance and behaviour at the elementary level. The results showed that easily frustrated children were likely to be high in irritability.

Temperament can be observed and assessed at the early childhood level, and this can help teachers to understand children's temperament — thereby helping them to develop social-emotional

skills that will reduce their risk of developing behavioural problems. Having knowledge of children's temperament can help teachers to develop interventions to address negative behaviours and conflicts (Isa et al., 2017). As Duckworth and Allred (2012, p. 638) noted, "interventions that teach children metacognitive strategies, such as goal setting and planning, can also improve self-regulatory competence and, in turn, academic outcomes".

INSIGHTS and Children's Temperament

Evidence from several studies revealed that engagement in INSIGHTS intervention programmes contributes to reductions in problem behaviours, greater responsiveness in disciplinary practices towards children from parents and teachers, enhanced behaviour management strategies for teachers, and improved academic outcomes and focused attention for students (McClowry et al., 2005; McClowry et al., 2010; O'Connor et al., 2014; Sealy et al., 2021). Teachers, parents, and students benefit from INSIGHTS because it helps "children and teachers recognize and work with temperament, thus fostering the development of social-emotional competence for navigating current and future challenges" (Blair et al., 2004; Perry, 2007 in Sealy et al., 2021, p. 10). Students who participate in INSIGHTS intervention programmes had improvement in behavioural engagement (McCormick et al., 2015; O'Connor et al., 2014) and exhibited less aggressive and disruptive behaviours (McClowry et al., 2010; McCormick et al., 2015). In addition, McClowry et al., (2010) found that children were more focused and more attentive to their work with fewer cases of emotional dispositional behaviours. There was also improvement in the academic development of shy children (O'Connor et al., 2014).

Males benefitted significantly from participating in INSIGHTS — those with temperament profiles that were industrious showed improvements in their literacy scores. In addition, boys who were considered cautious had higher mathematics scores, in comparison

to girls (Collins et al., 2017). It is noteworthy that INSIGHTS intervention programmes have the strongest benefit among at-risk children (McClowry et al., 2005; McCormick et al., 2015). According to McClowry et al. (2005) the intervention improves the behaviour of students who are diagnosed with disruptive behaviour disorder; while for McCormick et al. (2015), high risk children who are impacted by the social reality of the family have improved outcomes when engaged in the programme.

The INSIGHTS programme also benefits teachers. Teachers learn strategies that help students to deal with aggressive behaviours based on their temperament. They are able to use meaningful responses when students engage in negative reactivity (McClowry et al., 2010). In addition, they learn to be sensitive to children and engage in reframing the reactivity of their responses (Collins et al., 2017; McClowry et al., 2010). According to McClowry et al. (2010, p. 30), "Teachers are taught to use scaffolding and stretching strategies for students whose temperaments are low in task persistence, a dimension of temperament often associated with attentional problems". The success of INSIGHTS in maintaining and developing self-regulatory skills after the early childhood level is due to its sustainability through the grades. This suggests that teachers should embed the programme in their curriculum delivery (McCormick et al., 2020).

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this qualitative study was to ascertain the views of the principal and teachers about the usefulness of the INSIGHTS into Children's Temperament Programme as a tool for enhancing teachers' behavioural management competence. The behavioural management approaches that were used by teachers before participating in the programme were explored. The following research questions guided the study:

RQ1: What behavioural management approaches did teachers use at the early childhood level before participating in INSIGHTS?

RQ2: What are educators' views on the usefulness of the INSIGHTS programmes?

Methodology

Research Context

The participating school was St. Tekakwitha (pseudonym), a Catholic institution that comprised an infant, primary, and single-sex high school for girls. This case study involved only the infant and primary schools in keeping with INSIGHTS target age group. The institution is located in a major urban area of Jamaica. St. Tekakwitha is a faith-based community that "fosters positive relationships among learners, teachers and parents". Tekakwitha, the infant school, was founded in August 1896 by the Roman Catholic Sisters to facilitate the education of children 4-6 years. For the years 2021 and 2022, The infant school had a capacity for 300 students, however, the school had 185 children enrolled, with ten teachers, one guidance counsellor, and the principal. Initially a preparatory school started 125 years ago, the primary school has a current population of 1,000 students. There are two principals: one for the infant school and one for the primary school. The infant school is a feeder school for the primary school.

The INSIGHTS intervention at this educational institution occurred in two phases. The first phase (2013) involved two teachers who taught a class of 5-year-olds at the infant level and two teachers who taught Grade one classes at the primary level. In addition, the two guidance counsellors from both the infant and primary schools participated in the INSIGHTS into Children's Temperament intervention for ten weeks.

Subsequent to this phase, the infant school became a licensed school for integrating INSIGHTS into the school's curriculum. As a licensed school, St. Tekakwitha Infant re-entered the programme, having previously participated

in the INSIGHTS intervention. In the first year as a licensed school, the school based facilitator (who is usually the Guidance Counsellor) trained as a programme facilitator at a 2-day training workshop and then implemented the programme for the required ten weeks. The guidance counsellor was monitored regularly; including visits from one of the team members of the INSIGHTS programme. The guidance counsellor was then assessed and the school subsequently certified by the INSIGHTS in Jamaica programme. It is important to note that the parent sessions can be facilitated by a team from INSIGHTS if the school makes the request. The school rents the INSIGHTS tools from the programme office at a minimum cost per academic year.

The guidance counselor who was trained as the facilitator for the programme is no longer employed to St. Tekakwitha and some of the teachers who were trained to implement the programme have also left the school, to be replaced by new teachers. During the COVID-19 pandemic, the principal thought it was opportune to organize an online professional development session for the teachers. From 2021 to 2022, the INSIGHTS programme was delivered via Zoom video conferencing software to 12 staff members of the St. Tekakwitha school for two hours once per week for eight weeks. The sessions were facilitated by two co-facilitators (university lecturers) who implemented the programme. In addition, the principal and the guidance counsellor also participated in the weekly sessions.

The present study reports on the 2014 phase when the school became licensed to integrate INSIGHTS into the curriculum. The programme is housed at the School of Education, The University of the West Indies, Mona Campus.

Participants

The participants for the two focus group discussions were ten teachers from all grade levels in the infant school, with more than two years of working experience; the principal of the infant school also participated in one of the focus group discussions.

Data Collection

Virtual focus group discussions were used to obtain principal's and teachers' views of the usefulness of the INSIGHTS into Children's Temperament programme as a tool for enhancing teachers' behavioural management competence. Using the Zoom video conferencing software, one of the programme facilitators moderated focus group discussions. Volunteers were organized into two groups; one group consisted of six classroom teachers and the other group had five participants including the principal. The focus group discussions were audio recorded and transcribed using otter.ai. Both facilitators read the transcription and modified it where necessary. The interview protocol used the following items as a guide for the focus group discussions:

1. Explain the behavioural management strategies you regularly use in managing the children's behaviour (before INSIGHTS).
2. How do you find the children's response to these strategies?
3. What is your understanding of the INSIGHTS programme?
4. What aspect(s) of the programme have you implemented? (Could you provide some details and examples).
5. How have the children responded to your implementation of the programme? (Anecdotal evidence/examples).
6. How has the programme impacted or influenced their behaviour in the class?

Data Analysis

Teachers' and principal's statements were coded using the constant comparative method of comparing each segment with the previous coded segments. Codes were grouped based on similarities. Both facilitators met regularly to code and analyze the data collected. QDA miner software was used to manage the qualitative data analysis process.

ACES-Understanding the Effects of Childhood Trauma Daniella Watson (2016)
<https://slideplayer.com/slide/13278289/>

Scenario 1

Quan is a 6 year old 1st grader who moved to Framingham from Vietnam when he was 4 years old. He has great difficulty dealing with disappointment and anger. He often wants to be first, particularly when lining up for class, and will cry, yell, kick and tantrum if he cannot be first. When Quan feels it is unfair that he is 'out' in a game, he exhibits these same behaviors. These episodes can last anywhere from 10 to 40 minutes, and can be triggered by something that appears to his teacher and peers to be very insignificant. These meltdowns prevent Quan from engaging in positive social peer interactions and leave him feeling very embarrassed once he has calmed down.

Results

The research questions guided the reporting of the results:

RQ1: What behavioural management approaches did teachers use at the early childhood level before participating in INSIGHTS?

Behavioural management approaches used by teachers at the early childhood level before participating in INSIGHTS were both productive and counterproductive. This suggests that teachers were using strategies which were effective in managing children's behaviour. However, because of the limited tools available, teachers admitted to employing some counterproductive strategies inadvertently — used in a primarily reactive manner to the situations in the moment. The theme *productive and counterproductive* reflects teachers' overall management approach before participating in the INSIGHTS programme.

Use of Productive Behaviour Management Approaches before INSIGHTS

Before INSIGHTS, teachers employed different behavioural management approaches, including reinforcements, behaviour modifications (time-out, sending students to the principal, and consulting with parents to understand a child). In addition, some teachers also believed in setting the tone at the beginning of the school year by instilling rules, structure, and expectations.

Reinforcements used were: providing tokens, points, and stickers; and praising the students. Teachers reported that students responded positively to reinforcement. The following are selected teachers' comments regarding the use of reinforcement:

I use my reward system where they get rewards at the end of the day, and at the end of the week ... this reward system, has been there long before INSIGHTS. I definitely use my stickers, my treasure chest, because if you're [students] good, you get to take something from my treasure chest, it might be daily or at the end of the week

I always use my reward charts where I give stickers and points. And I always use rewards, for example, I keep my points system. So, at the end of the year, students will be getting their trophies and so forth from my class, so they work towards achieving these.

Behaviour modification was utilized by some teachers in addressing problem behaviours. Some teachers would re-direct the students' attention by getting them to participate in activities. The teachers expressed their perspectives:

I would do a number of finger plays, I would say stretch your arms up to do a lot of actions to bring them back and then I would talk to them about the noise or what they were doing. Hands up, down, forward, sideways, and then you'll get everybody's attention, and then you can speak to them.

In addition, the teachers noted that strategies such as finger play and the teachers presence projecting authority helped children to be more attentive and controlled in their behaviour during classes:

I use finger play and so forth to get their attention. Or sometimes for me, I'll just stand in the room. And once my presence is there, and I stand looking at them, you'll hear the group leaders, because I use group a leader system, the group leaders would be saying to the members of their group, "Miss is in the room", or "Miss come in". So once your presence is there, they will just get quiet, or you will hear them whispering to each other to get quiet. You just stand in that room and they understand what it means.

Consultation with the children's parents helps the teachers to get a better understanding of the students and to determine the most appropriate strategies to be used:

Just hearing from the parents to find out what they did.

Some teachers were of the opinion that their college training was more theoretical and not practical. This can be observed from the following comment:

We have read the theories, but they do not apply to us. The context is different.

Use of Counterproductive Behaviour Management Approaches before INSIGHTS

There was consensus among all the teachers that before exposure to INSIGHTS they would rely heavily on harsh disciplinary strategies such as corporal punishment, rough talking, naughty corner, put students out of the class, hands on their heads, and silence. These strategies were considered by the teachers on reflection to be counterproductive and punitive.

"Timeout" and "the naughty corner" were seen as synonymous prior to INSIGHTS. Teachers commented:

The timeout corner, I find that a lot of times the children will adhere because nobody wants to go to that corner. Nobody wants to be in the naughty corner. Because guess what? If you go in the naughty corner, you don't get to take anything from the treasure chest. Before the program, we would have used the methodologies we were taught in college like timeout.

Quarrelling with the students was another example of counterproductive action by the teachers. Teachers even admitted to not negotiating with their students concerning consequences for behaviour.

Now, seriously, so when they become disruptive, I tend to get a little bit loud and quarrel and say no. Put them [the student] in a corner. Remove them from the class itself. I put them in the naughty corner. I send them to the principal.

Well, for me, the whole task is in punishment. Everybody has their heads down. If they're not cooperating, they would stand up with their hands on their head. It wasn't a matter of negotiation. You're disruptive then you get punishment...the approach will silence them for the whole time.

Teachers admitted that some of their strategies did not have a sustainable effect on children's behaviour in the classroom:

Well, for me, it would work for a while, for a period of time. And then they would just get disruptive again. Everybody would be quiet for a while, until another week, they went back into the same mode. It was very frustrating. Because you're applying the practices you learned in theory at college, but it doesn't apply to Jamaican children. You place them in a corner and they will be playing with the wall.

RQ2: What are educators' views on the usefulness of the INSIGHTS Programmes?

Educators view the INSIGHTS programme as a comprehensive one that helps them to understand the differences in students' temperament and how to deal with these differences. The teachers' perspective is that INSIGHTS also helps the students to understand themselves and develop problem-solving skills. In addition, they were more informed on how to use time-out effectively and gained additional tools for training students in how to behave in a regulated manner. The themes that emerged from teachers' and principal's feedback following their participation in the programme were: INSIGHTS enhanced relationships and the skills learned through INSIGHTS are sustainable and transferrable.

INSIGHTS Enhances Relationships in the Classroom

INSIGHTS is a comprehensive programme that enhances relationships in the classroom. Teachers recognise that the INSIGHTS programme helps with improving relationships among all stakeholders in the school, specifically teachers, parents, and children — thus enhancing social interactions in the classroom. The teachers felt that the principles of INSIGHTS were comprehensive because they were not restricted to the classroom only. They shared that:

The INSIGHTS program, it's not only for the teachers, the INSIGHTS program caters for teachers, students, parents, and caregivers. INSIGHTS is a program that helps the teacher, the students, the parents, any adults or anybody, for that matter, to deal with different people, and helps you to understand that even though we think that everybody should probably have an idea of how to behave, the programme helps them to regulate their behaviour.

INSIGHTS program benefits all stakeholders involved in raising children.

The INSIGHTS programme helps teachers to understand and reframe how they see misbehaviour. Some teachers state that the programme helped them to deal with students in different situations and from different environments; to understand that each student has a unique temperament. They explained that, INSIGHTS:

Helps us to know the students, know their temperaments and know that no child is rude. So it's just that they are different in temperament and we now learn to adapt.

Everybody has a different temperament no matter what age you are, or whether you are a child or an adult ... INSIGHTS helps the teachers to find the best ways to deal with children who have different temperaments.

St. Tekakwitha school's earlier participation in the programme involved not only teachers, but parents and children. The programme was implemented in a comprehensive manner, so that parallel to the 8-week teacher sessions, there were also parent and child sessions for the same duration. The teachers who gave feedback on the

most recent training in the programme were reflecting on the sustainable effects of INSIGHTS on children's problem-solving and relationship skills. They shared that:

The programme definitely helps them [students] to problem solve. When they have issues that they need to solve they stop, think about it and then they plan what they're going to do. A lot of them will come to you and tell you, miss I have a dilemma. So they get the understanding.

INSIGHTS assisted teachers in understanding the differences among children and teachers explained how the programme has continued to influence children's interactions.

The Skills Learned through Insights are Sustainable and Transferrable

The INSIGHTS programme is sustainable, and the skills are transferrable to other situations beyond the school environment. Evidence of the sustainability of INSIGHTS is that not only are children applying the principles at school, but they are transferring these principles to their homes. Teachers reported that the children would label their parents with the different temperament profiles and use the strategies (such as negotiation) when communicating with their parents. This internalization of INSIGHTS principles by the children reflects the posture of the school; INSIGHTS has been built into the school's culture. The teachers voiced the following perspectives:

It works. It's sustainable.

Our students are calmer, less likely to get into altercations, they are more the mediators, they're more tolerant of their peers, because they learn not to get frustrated easily.

Across cohorts we have seen this for over six years. We don't have fights and that's what is amazing about the program, it's sustainable.

I was given the opportunity to participate in INSIGHTS and to learn and to take away what I've learned to use in everyday life, not only at school.

The principal interjected by voicing:

For me INSIGHTS has made me look good. As a principal at a school that is very calm, we

don't have a lot of complaints from parents about students being aggressive. To me, the fact that the teachers have been trained in INSIGHTS is another asset, because when they deal with the students, it's a matter of a wanting to come to school. So for me, it is less stress on the principal, everybody used to take students to the principal's office.

Now, I rarely have cases unless it's a new teacher. And then she's like — I want to do INSIGHTS, I need to do INSIGHTS because she's hearing the students. She's hearing the other teachers. And it's a wonderful tool; I think it is the only tool for behaviour management right now. Because the theory that we learn at college doesn't apply as well as INSIGHTS, I've done, so that adaptability and being able to see less violence, even coming from a violent home, the children are helping the parents who are having issues in the home as mediators, I'm talking 4- and 5-year-olds. So for me, INSIGHTS has been a blessing.

In addition, the principal explained that parents who participated in earlier sessions endorsed the INSIGHTS programme and recommended it to other parents for training, noting:

When the parents started to complain, two parents [during a PTA meeting] turned and said — that's why you need to do the INSIGHTS programme. I was so impressed, the parents turn to the parents and say, "so when is the other one, Miss when can we sign up?". This is what we are getting because the parents know that when my child does X, Y, Z, I use this strategy and the other one agreed and said yes, INSIGHTS is working and more parents need to join INSIGHTS.

The principal continued to highlight the effects of INSIGHTS by noting that the principles are internalized by the students in that she hears the students using the vocabulary learnt in the programme and implementing the solving dilemmas principles. This suggests that the students who participated in INSIGHTS were not only transferring learning from the sessions to their everyday interactions, but through these interactions influencing other students who did not participate in the programme. The principal reported:

You can see the difference in the students when they talk about their dilemma. When they use the word, the different terms, the characters—they are fascinated by the characters. Okay, so you can see even the look on their faces when they are watching the vignettes. So I think the characters in the vignettes, and the words that they use, the different words, temperament, dilemma, the students are really interested in them and they use these words and talk about them even at play outside. So even though the 4-year-olds' teachers don't practice it, the 4-year-olds will learn from the 5-year-olds in the yard while they play. So you will hear them say to a baby, "we are having a dilemma here".

They love to come and tell you, "Miss I have a dilemma". I remember, once a child said, "Miss, stop, I have a dilemma". So the whole class said, and I looked at them, and they were the ones who helped her solve the dilemma. So that's the part that I find tends to stick with them. Whether we wish to believe it or not, their little lives have dilemmas. And once they're able to deal with it, once they're able to stop and think and think that they can resolve their dilemmas, they are fine. And the fact that they are even able to recognize they have a problem, and try to figure out ways in which they can work it out or ask for help.

Teachers, parents, and students benefit from the programme when it is reflected in children's behaviour and their approach to problems at school and at home. Teachers are of the view that INSIGHTS empowers children by showing them that they have choices. Students are able to evaluate and apply problem-solving strategies and negotiate with their teachers and parents when there is a dilemma. The principal was confident that the INSIGHTS programme contributed to children's overall social and emotional growth and problem-solving skills, commenting:

The students feel empowered; and practicing it. Yes, so you find that crosses boundaries and break down barriers, they're using it with their siblings. Yes, come on. Come on, we were having

a dilemma. And they're going to the parents with the dilemma, they had to try and solve it. Now, they [parent] are learning that their children help them to solve their own problems. For example they [children] will say, "alright mommy, I know, you don't have eggs but you have sausage, and if you don't have the sausage I'll take porridge".

The INSIGHTS programme has psycho-emotional benefits for teachers; they develop patience and are able to manage their emotions. It was expressed by some of the teachers that before INSIGHTS, counterproductive methods were used to deal with challenging students. Following their participation in the programme, the teachers voiced that they were now more competent in managing their emotions. This is reflected in the following comments:

It has helped me to calm down, learn patience.

I learned great patience, and what more for me actually emphasize the love, love and attention that they [children] seek.

INSIGHTS helped me to deal with the situation at hand and to be very calm when I'm doing so. Well, for me, it has helped me to exercise a little more patience and think about INSIGHTS and using different steps.

Teachers have also gained more understanding, and appreciate the differences in students through INSIGHTS.

INSIGHTS helps me to better assist the child with the personality or the trait that they have.

Because you can't treat everybody the same way and so INSIGHTS, opens your eyes in how to treat a situation. And to bring all the positive out of that situation.

The INSIGHTS programme helps teachers to reframe how they view misbehaviour and influences the behavioural management strategies utilized. The most effective strategies for teachers were contracts with children and parents, negotiating, solving the dilemmas using the stop light, and social competence strategies. Similar strategies were presented when teachers were asked to share how they would respond to

a child who has issues waiting his turn and was likely to be disruptive whenever he does not get what he wants. There was overwhelming support among teachers for negotiating with the student and using contracts to reduce the negative behaviour. Teachers' comments included:

I would negotiate with Juan[student], in negotiating and helping Juan to understand that, yes, it's good to be first, but not always, because somebody should get a chance to lead. We could do a contract to say, look, you're going to lead today, tomorrow, you're going to help me to choose a leader.

I could enter into contracts. But that's the last resort, the first is to help him to recognize that we cannot always be first or not all the time we would win and what we will use for that is for them to stop and empathize with others, to see how they feel. So it's learning to negotiate. Yes, so literally stop, think, I would do the stoplight as well, reasoning as well.

Despite the positive gains from INSIGHTS there were some teachers who still had misunderstandings of certain principles. Some misunderstandings were about temperament and the dimensions. Some teachers did not remember that they were told in the sessions that they should look for the predominant behaviour in children's response to the environment to determine their temperament profile. A few of the teachers were still not clear on how to identify the children's temperament profile. A few teachers felt that temperament changed based on the situation and environment; in other words temperament was unstable.

I am also aware that I have multiple temperaments and it helps me to better understand the students who do and who display them more than the others.

Because a student might be well behaved in class, but once they go outside on the playground, that student's temperament may change. So we know how to deal with the student when in the particular situation that they're in.

This finding suggests that some teachers may need further clarification and reinforcement of the core INSIGHTS principles. For example, if a temperament dimension such as task persistence

had other dimensions (such as being withdrawn), it was difficult for the teachers to understand the combined dimension in students. So teachers can get locked into the positive dimension of the child's temperament and neglect the shy aspect that the child will need skills to manage.

Discussion and Conclusion

Teachers' feedback on INSIGHTS into Children's Temperament gave us some understanding of how the programme impacted teachers, the classroom, and the school environment; and highlighted teachers' classroom management approaches before participation in the programme. Before INSIGHTS, teachers used both effective and counterproductive behaviour management approaches. Based on the findings, it can be argued that before INSIGHTS there was a mismatch between the support provided by some teachers and the temperaments of their students. These results reinforced those of Hipson and Séguin (2015) and Roubinov et al. (2017) that the relationship between teacher and student impacts the quality interaction in the classroom. Some strategies used by the teachers were effective, because they used certain classroom management approaches learnt in college, such as managing students' behaviours through reinforcement and behaviour modification. However, others said that there were gaps in their training—which is one of the reasons they struggled with counterproductive strategies as teachers. They felt that their training in college was too theoretical and did not equip them fully with practical tools for behavioural management in the classroom.

According to Bandura's Social Learning Theory, the repeated reinforcement of the desired behaviour is likely to result in children exhibiting the behaviour in the future (Bandura, 1965; Bandura & Walters, 1977). Teachers modeling behaviour along with reinforcement are likely to contribute even more effectively to students' behaviour regulation. Students learn effective and counterproductive behaviours from their teachers by observing the daily activities of the teachers. This is particularly true at the

early childhood level where children are in their formative years. Social learning theorists argue that after a certain time these behaviours are internalized by children paying attention and modeling what they observed. Therefore, it is imperative that teachers are continuously trained and participate in professional development to increase their capacity and skills in classroom management strategies.

The INSIGHTS programme is considered efficacious in helping teachers understand and work with students (Cappella et al., 2015). The current findings suggest that teachers are more understanding and appreciative of the role of students' temperament in managing their behaviour in the classroom. Teachers now realize that their limited understanding of students' temperaments can lead to harsh discipline (Kinkead-Clark, 2020). In accepting the importance of temperament in understanding children, teachers have also accepted responsibility for creating a goodness of fit environment in the classroom. The goodness of fit principle involves realizing that behaviour management strategies are more optimal when aligned with students' unique temperaments. Hence, the INSIGHTS programme challenges teachers to accept differences in their students and see "misbehaviours" as teachable moments—since all temperaments have strengths and constraints. It is these constraints that children need to learn how to manage as they grow and mature.

The strategies of INSIGHTS not only enhance relationships but as the teachers testified, they are transferrable. Furthermore, teachers also applied the INSIGHTS strategies in their households. Parents reported to the principal and teachers how their children were using the INSIGHTS vocabulary at home and implementing the strategy for solving dilemmas; teachers confirmed observing children managing their dilemmas on the playground. Despite the positive feedback, there were some principles that a few of the teachers seemed to have misunderstood. For example, a number of teachers referred to

children as having multiple temperaments and did not have a clear understanding of the combined dimensions. This suggests that facilitators will need to spend more time on these issues in future training by giving more activities such as role-play to clarify and discuss these misconceptions.

Overall the findings from this study are consistent with those of Cappella et al. (2015) and the results reflect those of McClowry et al. (2005), McClowry et al. (2010), O'Connor et al. (2014), and Sealy et al. (2021) that the INSIGHTS programme contributes to a reduction in behavioural problems, and improves behaviour management strategies by teachers who are more thoughtful in their use of disciplinary practices. Therefore, it can be concluded that the INSIGHTS programme is transformative because it promotes mindset change in how teachers perceive children's temperament and behaviour while enhancing positive behaviour in the classroom.

Sharline Cole, PhD is a Lecturer in Educational Psychology and Applied Research in the School of Education at The University of the West Indies, Mona. Dr. Cole's research focuses on parenting, parental involvement, family engagement, children with special needs, psycho-social, academic and emotional wellbeing of students and educators, aggression and violence and teacher effectiveness.

Email: sharline.cole02@uwimona.edu.jm

Loraine D. Cook, PhD is a Professor in Educational Psychology at the School of Education, The University of the West Indies, Mona. Professor Cook is a co-editor of the *Caribbean Journal of Mixed Methods Research*. She was the recipient of the Fulbright Visiting Researcher Award (2011), and has been a visiting scholar in Applied Psychology at the New York University, and the University of British Columbia, Canada.

Email: loraine.cook02@gmail.com

References

- Bandura, A. (1965). Influence of models' reinforcement contingencies on the acquisition of imitative responses. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 1(6), 589–595. <https://doi.org/10.1037/h0022070>
- Bandura, A. (1977). *Social learning theory*. Retrieved from <http://www.garfield.library.upenn.edu/classics1991/A1991GE30100001.pdf>
- Bandura, A., & Walters, R. (1977). *Social learning theory*. Prentice Hall.
- Cappella, E., O'Connor, E. E., McCormick, M., Turbeville, A., Collins, A., & McClowry, S. G. (2015). Classwide efficacy of *INSIGHTS*: Observed student behaviors and teacher practices in kindergarten and first grade. *Elementary School Journal*, 116(2), 217–241. <https://doi.org/10.1086/683983>
- Center for Early Childhood Mental Health Consultation, Innovation and Improvement Project. (n. d.). Infant Toddler Temperament Tool (IT³), Infant version. *Supporting a "Goodness of fit."* Retrieved from https://www.ecmhc.org/documents/CECMHC_IT3_Booklet_Infant.pdf
- Center on the Social and Emotional Foundations for Early Learning. (2010). *Understanding temperament in infants and toddlers*. What Works Brief Series, 23. Retrieved from https://challengingbehavior.cbcs.usf.edu/docs/whatworks/WhatWorksBrief_23.pdf
- Collins, A., O'Connor, E., & McClowry, S. (2017). The role of a temperament intervention in kindergarten children's standardized academic achievement. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 5(2), 120–139. <https://doi.org/10.11114/jets.v5i2.2138>
- David, E. S. (2016). The significance of social learning theories in the teaching of social studies education. *International Journal of Sociology and Anthropology Research*, 2(1), 40–45.
- Duckworth, A. L., & Allred, K. M. (2012). Temperament in the classroom. In R. L. Shiner & M. Zentner (Eds.), *Handbook of temperament* (pp. 627–644). Guilford Press.
- Hipson, W. E., & Séguin, D. G. (2015). Is good fit related to good behaviour? Goodness of fit between daycare teacher–child relationships, temperament, and prosocial behaviour. *Early Child Development and Care*, 186(5), 785–798. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03004430.2015.1061518>
- Hipson, W. E., & Séguin, D. G. (2017). Goodness of fit model. In V. Zeigler-Hill & T. K. Shackelford (Eds.), *Encyclopedia of Personality and Individual Differences* (pp. 1–3). Springer Link. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-28099-8_757-1
- Horsburgh, I., & Ippolito, K. (2018). A skill to be worked at: Using social learning theory to explore the process of learning from role models. *BMC Medical Education*, 18, 156. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-018-1251-x>
- Isa, Z. B. M., Teh, K. S. B. M., Pisal, N. A., & Baka, A. A. (2017). Children temperament and implications for preschool teachers. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 7(8), 175–182. <https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBS/v7-i8/3219>
- Kelland, M. (2021). Social learning theory and personality development. In M. Kelland (Ed.), *Personality theory in a cultural context* (Module 18). Retrieved from <https://cnx.org/contents/IISyy6OT@1.1:oiev6HcT@1/Social-Learning-Theory-and-Personality-Development>

- Kinthead-Clark, Z. (2020). Using temperament-based approaches to negotiate the terrains of crisis in Jamaican early childhood classrooms. *Journal of Early Childhood Teacher Education*, 41(3), 209–222. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10901027.2019.1609142>
- Kornienko, D. S. (2016). Child temperament and mother's personality as a predictors of maternal relation to child. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 233, 343–347. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.10.148>
- McClowry, S., Snow, D. L., & Tamis-LeMonda, C. S. (2005). An evaluation of the effects of "INSIGHTS" on the behavior of inner city primary school children. *J Prim Prev*, 26(6), 567–584. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10935-005-0015-7>
- McClowry, S. G., Snow, D. L., Tamis-LeMonda, C. S., & Rodriguez, E. T. (2010). Testing the efficacy of *INSIGHTS* on student disruptive behavior, classroom management, and student competence in inner city primary grades. *School Mental Health*, 2, 23–35. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12310-009-9023-8>
- McClowry, S. G. (2014). *Temperament-based elementary classroom management*. Rowman & Littlefield.
- McCormick, M. P., O'Connor, E. E., Cappella, E., & McClowry, S. G. (2015). Getting a good start in school: Effects of *INSIGHTS* on children with high maintenance temperaments. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 30 (Part A), 128–139. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecresq.2014.10.006>
- McCormick, M. P., Neuhaus, R., O'Connor, E. E., White, H. I., Horn, E. P., Harding, S., Cappella, E., & McClowry, S. (2020). Long-term effects of social-emotional learning on academic skills: Evidence from a randomized trial of *INSIGHTS*. *Journal of Research on Educational Effectiveness*, 14(1), 1–27. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19345747.2020.1831117>
- Middleton, M. (2012). *Match between parent and child temperament: Implications for parenting behaviors and children's behavior problems*. Electronic Theses and Dissertations, 2004–2019. 4820. <https://stars.library.ucf.edu/etd/4820>
- Nabavi, R. T. (2012). *Bandura's social learning theory & social cognitive learning theory*. Retrieved from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/267750204_Bandura's_Social_Learning_Theory_Social_Cognitive_Learning_Theory/link/545914d90cf26d5090ad007b/download
- Nelson, B., Martin, R. P., Hodge, S., Havill, V., & Kamphaus, R. (1999). Modeling the prediction of elementary school adjustment from preschool temperament. *Personality and Individual Differences*, 26, 687–700. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0191-8869\(98\)00174-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0191-8869(98)00174-3)
- O'Connor, E. E., Cappella, E., McCormick, M. P., & McClowry, S. G. (2014). An examination of the efficacy of *INSIGHTS* in enhancing the academic and behavioral development of children in early grades. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 106(4), 1156–1169. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0036615>
- Ostergren, C. (2004). *Parenting your unique child*. Retrieved from <https://parenting.extension.wisc.edu/files/2023/03/Parenting-Your-Unique-child-month12.pdf>
- Roubinov, D. S., Hagan, M. J., Boyce, W. T., Essex, M. J., & Bush, N. R. (2017). Child temperament and teacher relationship interactively predict cortisol expression:

- The prism of classroom climate.
Development and Psychopathology, 29(5),
1763–1775. [https://doi.org/10.1017/
S0954579417001389](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0954579417001389)
- Sealy, M. A., Rudasill, K. M., Barrett, J.
S., Eum, J., Adams, N., Hinrichs, A., &
McClowry, S. (2021). Temperament in the
early elementary classroom: Implications
for practice. In M. Jose Hernández-Serrano
(Ed.), *Teacher Education in the 21st
Century* (Ch. 15). IntechOpen. [https://doi.
org/10.5772/intechopen.96270](https://doi.org/10.5772/intechopen.96270)
- Slavin, R. E. (2012). *Educational psychology:
Theory and practice* (10th ed.). Pearson.
- Watson, D. (2016). ACES - *Understanding the
effects of childhoodtrauma*. [Powerpoint
slides]. Slideplayer.
<https://slideplayer.com/slide/13278289/>
- White, A. S., Sirota, K. N., Frohn, S. E.,
& Rudasill, K. M. (2018). Children's
temperament and transition to
kindergarten: A question of "fit". In
A. Mashburn, J. LoCasale-Crouch & K.
Pears (Eds.). *Kindergarten transition
and readiness*. SpringerLink. [https://doi.
org/10.1007/978-3-319-90200-5_10](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-90200-5_10)
-